

17 September 2018

**TO:** Waikato Regional Council  
By email: [healthyivers@waikatoregion.govt.nz](mailto:healthyivers@waikatoregion.govt.nz)

**FROM:** Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated  
Attn: Rebecca Stirnemann  
PO Box 108 055  
Symonds Street  
Auckland 1150

Contact: [R.Stirnemann@forestandbird.org.nz](mailto:R.Stirnemann@forestandbird.org.nz) or 021 482 3145

## Further submission on the Proposed Plan Change 1 and Variation 1 to the Waikato Regional Plan

1. Forest & Bird represents a relevant aspect of the public interest, and has an interest greater than the public generally. Forest & Bird is New Zealand's largest non-governmental conservation organization representing its members and supporters, and made a submission on proposed PC1 to the Waikato Regional Plan.
2. Forest and Bird could not gain an advantage in trade competition through this submission.
3. Forest & Bird wishes to be heard in support of this submission, and would be prepared to consider presenting this submission in a joint case with others making a similar submission at any hearing.

### Introduction

4. Forest & Bird is New Zealand's largest non-governmental conservation organization with many members and supporters. Forest & Bird originally set out to protect New Zealand's unique flora and fauna, the tasks of Forest and Bird in more recent years have extended to protecting and maintaining the environment surrounding the flora and fauna.
5. Forest & Bird is concerned that some of the decisions sought to the Regional Plan would result in loss of indigenous biodiversity and are inconsistent with the National Policy Statement for Freshwater Management 2015 (amended 2017) ("NPF FM") direction to set objectives and limits to improve freshwater management to maintain and enhance water quality and associated ecosystems. Forest & Bird also supports a number of submissions which seek to retain or amend provisions of the plan to protect, maintain and enhance freshwater quality and the indigenous biodiversity of the region. Our further submissions are set out in the Table 1 and Table 2 below.

**Table 1:** Forest & Bird generally supports or opposes the following submissions in full on both PC1 and Variation 1, other than where we have sought specific relief on specific decisions requested in Table 2 (PC1) or Table 3 (V1) below.

| <b>Submitter Name/Submitter ID</b>                                                     | <b>provision</b>    | <b>Submission Point ID</b> | <b>Support/ Oppose</b> | <b>Reason for Support/Opposition</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | <b>Decision sought</b> |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------|----------------------------|------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------|
| Auckland/Waikato Fish and Game and Eastern Region Fish and Game<br>Submitter ID: 74085 | PC1 and Variation 1 | all                        | support                | The amendments sought give effect to the NPS FM, the RPS and Part 2 of the RMA<br><br>Forest and bird supports the submission other than where the amendments seek outcomes for exotic species and this is not to the benefit of indigenous species or enhancement of indigenous biodiversity.                                                                                                     | Allow                  |
| Department of Conservation<br>Submitter ID: 71759                                      | PC1 and Variation 1 | all                        | support                | The amendments sought give effect to the NPS FM, the RPS and Part 2 of the RMA.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | Allow                  |
| Federated Farmers of New Zealand<br>Submitter ID: 74191                                | PC1 and Variation 1 | all                        | oppose                 | The amendments sought will result in a loss of indigenous biodiversity values which is inconsistent with councils functions and responsibilities under section 30(1)(ga) and Section 6 the RMA. Do not give effect to the NPS FM and the NZCPS.<br>The amendments sought include changes to the wording which shifts the focus away from achieving the ecological outcomes within a timely manner. | Disallow               |
| Fonterra cooperative group<br>Submitter ID: 74057                                      | PC1 and Variation 1 | all                        | oppose                 | The amendments sought are inappropriate                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | disallow               |
| Fulton Hogan Limited<br>Submitter ID: 74048                                            | PC1 and Variation 1 | all                        | oppose                 | The amendments sought are to not recognise and provide for s6 matters. overall the amendments sought are inconsistent with achieving the purpose of the act and do not give effect to the NPS FM.                                                                                                                                                                                                  | disallow               |

**Table 2:** Forest & Bird further submits on the following specific decisions requested on PC1:

| Submitter Name/Submitter ID                               | provision                                                             | Submission Point ID | Support/ Oppose | Reason for Support/Opposition                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Decision sought |
|-----------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------|-----------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| <b>Background and explanation</b>                         |                                                                       |                     |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                 |
| Horticulture New Zealand (HortNZ)<br>Submitter ID: 73801  | Collaborative approach                                                | PC1-9898            | Support in part | Amendments to acknowledge that the plan does not adequately address all sources of contaminants that impact on values identified in the Vision and Strategy are appropriate.                                                                                                                                                                                 | Allow           |
| Balle Bros Group<br>Submitter ID: 67834                   | Full achievement of the Vision and Strategy will be intergenerational | PC1-11380           | oppose          | The amendments sought are inappropriate. Changing the words “Full achievement of the Vision and Strategy” to “The 80-year timeframe recognizes the 'innovation gap' that means full achievement of water quality requires technologies or practices that are not yet available or economically feasible.” Undermines the objectives and purpose of the plan. | disallow        |
| <b>3.11.2 Objectives</b>                                  |                                                                       |                     |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                 |
| Beef + Lamb New Zealand Limited<br>Submitter ID: 73369    | Objectives general                                                    | PC1-11150           | oppose          | The amendments sought are uncertain. Timeframes are not specified and terminology such as “appropriately enable” is subjective.                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | disallow        |
| Hancock Forest Management (NZ) Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 73724 | New objective                                                         | PC1-5368            | oppose          | The amendment sought is inappropriate. The objective combines adverse effects with positive effects on different matters such that the requirement to avoid, remedy or mitigate become uncertain.                                                                                                                                                            | disallow        |
| <b>Objective 2</b>                                        |                                                                       |                     |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                 |
| Fonterra Co-operative Group Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74057    | Objective 2                                                           | PC1-10457           | oppose          | The amendment sought is not consistent with sustainable development expressed in part 2 of the Act. The wording proposed creates uncertainty and subjective when considering land use change, new use and development activities.                                                                                                                            | disallow        |

| Objective 3                                              |             |           |        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |          |
|----------------------------------------------------------|-------------|-----------|--------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| Beef + Lamb New Zealand Limited<br>Submitter ID: 73369   | Objective 3 | PC1-11482 | oppose | The amendments sought are inconsistent with the sustainable management purpose of the RMA and do not give effect to the NPS FM. The suggested extensions to timeframes are inappropriate.                                                      | disallow |
| Horticulture New Zealand (HortNZ)<br>Submitter ID: 73801 | Objective 3 | PC1-9945  | Oppose | Amendments are uncertain as they provide an alternative which is not measured against achieving the objective targets. The plan would not give effect to the NPS FM                                                                            | disallow |
|                                                          |             |           |        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |          |
| Objective 4                                              |             |           |        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |          |
| Beef + Lamb New Zealand Limited<br>Submitter ID: 73369   | Objective 4 | PC1-11483 | oppose | The amendments sought are uncertain and appear to extent timeframes required to meet water quality targets. Non-regulatory methods may be appropriate to set out how council will support community and partnership initiatives.               | disallow |
| Fonterra Co-operative Group Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74057   | Objective 4 | PC1-10468 | oppose | While the values and uses identified in Section 3.11.1 may be considered however as written it is not clear that values which are or contribute to a matter of national importance are to be recognised and provided for, not only considered. | disallow |
| Horticulture New Zealand (HortNZ)<br>Submitter ID: 73801 | Objective 4 | PC1-10005 | oppose | The amendments sought are not appropriate. Nutrient management and modelling tools are already available. Reductions of nutrient and sediment discharges must address adverse effects and achieve water quality targets.                       | disallow |
|                                                          |             |           |        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |          |
| 3.11.3 Policies                                          |             |           |        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |          |

|                                                                          |                  |           |        |                                                                                                                                                                                                        |          |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------|-----------|--------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| Beef + Lamb New Zealand Limited<br>Submitter ID: 73369                   | Policies general | PC1-11484 | oppose | The amendments sought are uncertain in terms of the sub-catchment approach and application of Appendix 1 attached to the submission.                                                                   | disallow |
| Chapman, Brenhan J<br>Submitter ID: 72776                                | Policies general | PC1-10261 | oppose | The amendments sought are inappropriate                                                                                                                                                                | disallow |
| Hamilton City Council<br>Submitter ID: 74051                             | Policies general | PC1-10259 | oppose | The amendments sought are inappropriate. Urbanisation should be planned for such that water quality targets can be met.                                                                                | disallow |
| Ravensdown Limited<br>Submitter ID: 74058                                | Policies general | PC1-10121 | oppose | Policy direction for consent duration is not necessary and the matters set out are not appropriate                                                                                                     | disallow |
| Waitomo District Council<br>Submitter ID: 73688                          | Policies general | PC1-11105 | oppose | The amendments sought do not set clear policy direction and are unlikely to achieve the objectives.                                                                                                    | disallow |
| <b>3.11.3 Policy 1</b>                                                   |                  |           |        |                                                                                                                                                                                                        |          |
| Advisory Committee on Regional Environment (ACRE)<br>Submitter ID: 72441 | Policy 1         | PC1-9536  | Oppose | The amendment is uncertain as to what levels of discharge will be determined as low/medium/high and reducing in order does not support a best practice approach.                                       | disallow |
| Beef + Lamb New Zealand Limited<br>Submitter ID: 73369                   | Policy 1         | PC1-11485 | oppose | Support the use of land use capability in appropriate circumstances. Enabling activities on this basis is uncertain to achieve water quality targets. The allocation approach set out is inappropriate | disallow |
| Beef + Lamb New Zealand Limited<br>Submitter ID: 73369                   | Policy 1         | PC1-12575 | oppose | A tailored or sub catchment approach is not appropriate                                                                                                                                                | disallow |
| Federated Farmers of New Zealand<br>Submitter ID: 74191                  | Policy 1         | PC1-10815 | oppose | The consideration of improvement only on specific contaminant contribution does not reflect the plans approach to best management practice.                                                            | disallow |
| Fertiliser Association                                                   | Policy 1         | PC1-9707  | oppose | The amendments sought are inappropriate and would                                                                                                                                                      | disallow |

|                                                                                |          |                                                                 |                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |          |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| of New Zealand<br>Submitter ID: 73305                                          |          |                                                                 |                    | exclude requirements for best management practice unless a sub-catchment is over allocated. .                                                                                                                                                                                           |          |
| <b>3.11.3 Policy 2</b>                                                         |          |                                                                 |                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |          |
| Advisory Committee<br>on Regional<br>Environment (ACRE)<br>Submitter ID: 72441 | Policy 2 | PC1-9505                                                        | Oppose             | The amendment is uncertain as to what levels of discharge will be determined as low/medium/high and reducing in order does not support a best practice approach.                                                                                                                        |          |
| <b>3.11.3 Policy 3</b>                                                         |          |                                                                 |                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |          |
| Fertiliser Association<br>of New Zealand<br>Submitter ID: 73305                | Policy 3 | PC1-9731                                                        | oppose             | The amendments sought are inappropriate and would exclude requirements for best management practice unless a sub-catchment is over allocated. .                                                                                                                                         | disallow |
| <b>3.11.4.8 next regional plan</b>                                             |          |                                                                 |                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |          |
| DairyNZ<br>Submitter ID: 74050                                                 | 3.11.4.8 | PC1-10241                                                       | oppose             | A nutrient allocation framework needs to be adopted as soon as possible.                                                                                                                                                                                                                | disallow |
| <b>3.11.5 Rules</b>                                                            |          |                                                                 |                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |          |
| Beef + Lamb New<br>Zealand Limited<br>Submitter ID: 73369                      | rules    | Beef + Lamb<br>New Zealand<br>Limited<br>Submitter ID:<br>73369 | Support in<br>part | A discretionary classification is not appropriate where non-compliance with conditions would result in an increase in nutrient loss/discharge.<br>Any nitrogen allocation regime would need appropriate provisions to give effect to the nutrient management requirements of the NPS FM | allow    |
| Federated Farmers of<br>New Zealand<br>Submitter ID: 74191                     | rules    | PC1-1084                                                        | oppose             | The amendments sought are not appropriate and would not achieve the objectives or give effect to the NPS FM.                                                                                                                                                                            | disallow |
| Horticulture New<br>Zealand (HortNZ)                                           | New rule | PC1-10162                                                       | oppose             | The amendments sought are not appropriate and create further uncertainty in achieving the objectives.                                                                                                                                                                                   | disallow |

|                                                                                              |          |           |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |          |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|-----------|-----------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| Submitter ID: 73801                                                                          |          |           |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |          |
| <b>3.11.5.1 Permitted Activity Rule</b>                                                      |          |           |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |          |
| Aston, Lucy<br>Submitter ID: 73020                                                           | 3.11.5.1 | PC1-7032  | oppose          | Combining the rules is not appropriate and the additional matters to be included in the rule/s are uncertain in achieving water quality outcomes necessary to give effect to the NPS FM.                                                                                                                                                                                                              | disallow |
| <b>3.11.5.1 Permitted Activity Rule– Farm activities</b>                                     |          |           |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |          |
| Alcock and Easton, Jo and John<br>Submitter ID: 73374                                        | 3.11.5.2 | PC1-9218  | oppose          | The amendments sought are inappropriate                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | disallow |
| Beef + Lamb New Zealand Limited<br>Submitter ID: 73369                                       | 3.11.5.2 | PC1-11502 | oppose          | The amendments sought are not appropriate                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | disallow |
| <b>3.11.5.3 Permitted Activity Rule– Farm activities.. under a Certified Industry Scheme</b> |          |           |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |          |
| Adams, Neville<br>Submitter ID: 74154                                                        | New rule | PC1-5062  | oppose          | Assumes a nitrogen reference point without any requirements. Not appropriate as permitted                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | disallow |
| Aitken, David John<br>Submitter ID: 71238                                                    | 3.11.5.3 | PC1-696   | oppose          | The amendments sought are inappropriate and would not achieve the purpose of the RMA.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | disallow |
| <b>3.11.5.4 Controlled Activity Rule – Farm activities.. not Certified Industry Scheme</b>   |          |           |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |          |
| Advisory Committee on Regional Environment (ACRE)<br>Submitter ID: 72441                     | 3.11.5.4 | PC1-11208 | Support in part | Any exceptions should be set out as permitted activities and will require careful consideration and clear identification of any low level discharges not required to be reduced.<br>The use of Overseer is supported so long as council requires adequate information and sets appropriate time frames to reduce nutrient loss and improve water quality. Reducing the reducing the nitrogen leaching | allow    |

|                                                                                                 |          |           |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                   |          |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|-----------|-----------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
|                                                                                                 |          |           |                 | from the 75 <sup>th</sup> percentile to below the 50 <sup>th</sup> percentile to achieve improved water quality should be considered within appropriate timeframes.                               |          |
| Fonterra Co-operative Group Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74057                                          | 3.11.5.4 | PC1-10500 | Support in part | The approach to splitting the rule clarifies the activity classifications, however the conditions and requirements need to ensure that there is no increase in diffuse discharge of contaminants. | allow    |
| <b>3.11.5.5 Controlled Activity Rule – Existing commercial vegetable production</b>             |          |           |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                   |          |
| Fonterra Co-operative Group Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74057                                          | 3.11.5.5 | PC1-10505 | Support in part | Clarification of the rule is supported however the dates added into g. should align with the dates in f.                                                                                          | allow    |
| Horticulture New Zealand (HortNZ)<br>Submitter ID: 73801                                        | 3.11.5.5 | PC1-10117 | oppose          | The amendments sought are uncertain and inappropriate. In particular the alternative/proxy nutrient reference calculation and inclusion of consent duration guidance.                             | disallow |
| <b>3.11.5.6 Restricted Discretionary Activity Rule – The use of land for farming activities</b> |          |           |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                   |          |
| Fonterra Co-operative Group Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74057                                          | 3.11.5.6 | PC1-10506 | oppose          | Any change in land use which may result in Any increase in diffuse discharges of contaminants should be non-complying.                                                                            | disallow |
| <b>3.11.5.7 Non-Complying Activity Rule – Land Use Change</b>                                   |          |           |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                   |          |
| Auckland/Waikato Fish and Game and Eastern Region Fish and Game<br>Submitter ID: 74085          | 3.11.5.7 | PC1-11002 | support         | Notification is appropriate                                                                                                                                                                       | allow    |

| 3.11.4                                                   |                 |           |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |          |
|----------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|-----------|-----------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| Beef + Lamb New Zealand Limited<br>Submitter ID: 73369   | New method      | PC1-11494 | oppose          | The amendment sought is uncertain in terms of the decision making and consenting aspects for a non-regulatory method.                                                                                                                                  | disallow |
| DairyNZ<br>Submitter ID: 74050                           | New method      | PC1-10239 | Support in part | Further research is supported however this should not be used as a reason to reduced targets or timeframes but farther to enable achieving then sooner.                                                                                                | allow    |
| Maniapoto Maori Trust Board<br>Submitter ID: 73730       | New method      | PC1-933   | oppose          | Methods to reduce diffuse discharges are supported however it is uncertain how the system proposed is intended to operate such that it does not differ a decision or information necessary t o make a decision until after consent is granted.         | disallow |
| Schedule 1 - Requirements for Farm Environment Plans/    |                 |           |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |          |
| Horticulture New Zealand (HortNZ)<br>Submitter ID: 73801 | New schedule 1C | PC1-12435 | oppose          | The amendment sought are not appropriate                                                                                                                                                                                                               |          |
| Horticulture New Zealand (HortNZ)<br>Submitter ID: 73801 | New schedule 1B | PC1-12435 | oppose          | The purpose of a separate vegetable cropping farm plan is uncertain. The measurement of nutrients is not consistent between the farm plans. The approach appear inconsistent with achieving the objectives of the plan and giving effect to the NPS FM | disallow |
| Horticulture New Zealand (HortNZ)<br>Submitter ID: 73801 | Schedule 1      | PC1-12436 | oppose          | The purpose of a separate vegetable cropping farm plan is uncertain. The measurement of nutrients is not consistent between the farm plans. The approach appear inconsistent with achieving the objectives of the plan and giving effect to the NPS FM | disallow |
| Te Arawa River Iwi Trust<br>Submitter ID: 73697          | Schedule 1      | PC1-11817 | support         | The amendments sought clarify requirements                                                                                                                                                                                                             | allow    |

|                                                                                        |                                      |           |                   |                                                                                                                                                                 |          |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|-----------|-------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
|                                                                                        |                                      |           |                   |                                                                                                                                                                 |          |
| <b>3.11.6 List of Tables</b>                                                           |                                      |           |                   |                                                                                                                                                                 |          |
| Fulton Hogan Limited<br>Submitter ID: 74048                                            | 3.11.6 List of<br>Tables and<br>Maps | PC1-10882 | oppose            | Inconsistent with achieving the objectives of the plan and giving effect to the NPS FM                                                                          | disallow |
| Lakes and Waterways<br>Action Group Trust<br>(LWAG) Submitter ID:<br>53342             | 3.11.6 List of<br>Tables and<br>Maps | PC1-4073  | support           | Will aid in achieving the objectives of the plan and giving effect to the NPS FM                                                                                | disallow |
| Fulton Hogan Limited<br>Submitter ID: 74048                                            | 3.11.6 List of<br>Tables and<br>Maps | PC1-10882 | Oppose in<br>part | Inconsistent with achieving the objectives of the plan and giving effect to the NPS FM                                                                          | disallow |
| <b>Table 3.11-1:</b>                                                                   |                                      |           |                   |                                                                                                                                                                 |          |
| Beef + Lamb New<br>Zealand Limited<br>Submitter ID: 73369                              | Table 3.11-1                         | PC1-11158 | Oppose in<br>part | Where inconsistent with achieving the objectives of the plan and giving effect to the NPS FM and the Ministry for the Environment's Clean Water package         | disallow |
| Waikato Environment<br>Centre Submitter ID:<br>73436                                   | Table 3.11.1                         | PC1-6231  | support           | Will aid in achieving the objectives of the plan and giving effect to the NPS FM                                                                                | allow    |
|                                                                                        |                                      |           |                   |                                                                                                                                                                 |          |
| <b>5.1.5 Conditions</b>                                                                |                                      |           |                   |                                                                                                                                                                 |          |
| New Zealand Farm<br>Forestry<br>Association - Waikato<br>Branch<br>Submitter ID: 73698 | 5.1.5                                | PC1-10132 | oppose            | The amendments sought are not appropriate as setbacks will not be sufficient in all locations and the notice requirement for a harvest plan should be retained. | disallow |
| Mercury NZ Limited<br>Submitter ID: 73182                                              | 5.1.5 q)(a)(iv)<br>and (b)(iv)       | PC1-9683  | oppose            | Not all districts have identified SNAs in their plans. Many areas in the region have not yet been surveyed and assessed.                                        | disallow |
|                                                                                        |                                      |           |                   |                                                                                                                                                                 |          |

| DEFINITIONS                                             |                                                  |           |        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |          |
|---------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|-----------|--------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| BT Mining Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 72453                    | New definition - Regionally significant industry | PC1-9921  | oppose | The amendment sought is not appropriate to give effect to the NPS FM and could result in outcomes which do not provide for protection required under s6 of the RMA                                                                                                                       | disallow |
| Department of Conservation<br>Submitter ID: 71759       | New definition – regionally significant industry | PC1-10658 | oppose | Provision for regionally significant industry is inappropriate for the reasons set out in Forest and Birds submission. If that submission is declined then careful consideration for a definition will be required. The submission is uncertain as to what the definition would include. | disallow |
| Oji Fibre Solutions (NZ) Limited<br>Submitter ID: 73725 | New definition – regionally significant industry | PC1-12311 | oppose | The amendment sought is not appropriate to give effect to the NPS FM and could result in outcomes which do not provide for protection required under s6 of the RMA                                                                                                                       | disallow |
| New Zealand Steel Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 73790            | New definition – regionally significant industry | PC1-3711  | oppose | The amendment sought is not appropriate to give effect to the NPS FM and could result in outcomes which do not provide for protection required under s6 of the RMA                                                                                                                       | disallow |
| Lumbercorp NZ Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 71753                | New definition – regionally significant industry | PC1-9960  | oppose | The amendment sought is not appropriate to give effect to the NPS FM and could result in outcomes which do not provide for protection required under s6 of the RMA                                                                                                                       | disallow |
| GBC Winstone<br>Submitter ID: 73992                     | New definition – regionally                      | PC1-2968  | oppose | The amendment sought is not appropriate to give effect to the NPS FM and could result in outcomes which do not provide for protection required under s6 of the RMA                                                                                                                       | disallow |

|                                                        |                                                        |           |        |                                                                                                                                                                    |          |
|--------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|-----------|--------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
|                                                        | significant industry                                   |           |        |                                                                                                                                                                    |          |
| Fonterra Co-operative Group Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74057 | New definition – Regionally significant infrastructure | PC1-10616 | oppose | The amendment sought is not appropriate to give effect to the NPS FM and could result in outcomes which do not provide for protection required under s6 of the RMA | disallow |
| Mercury NZ Limited<br>Submitter ID: 73182              | New definition – regionally significant industry       | PC1-9687  | oppose | The amendment sought is not appropriate to give effect to the NPS FM and could result in outcomes which do not provide for protection required under s6 of the RMA | disallow |
| AFFCO New Zealand Limited<br>Submitter ID: 74140       | New definition - Regionally significant industry       | PC1-7620  | oppose | The amendment sought is not appropriate to give effect to the NPS FF and could result in outcomes which do not provide for protection required under s6 of the RMA | disallow |
| AFFCO New Zealand Limited<br>Submitter ID: 74140       | New definition - best practicable option               | PC1-7620  | oppose | Guidance is better than including a definition which could be inconsistent with the RMA.                                                                           | disallow |
| Department of Conservation<br>Submitter ID: 71759      | New definition – low discharge activity                | PC1-10658 | oppose | The amendment sought is uncertain. Any limits should be specific to the relevant provisions.                                                                       | disallow |
| Ata Rangi 2015 Limited Partnership                     | New definition -                                       | PC1-11376 | oppose | The amendment sought is uncertain                                                                                                                                  | disallow |

|                                                          |                                                        |           |        |                                                                                                                                                     |          |
|----------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|-----------|--------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| Submitter ID: 74045                                      | low level discharge                                    |           |        |                                                                                                                                                     |          |
| Dairy Goat Co-Operative (N.Z) Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74044 | New definition – Stock or Live stock                   | PC1-4140  | oppose | It is not appropriate to exclude animals which are farmed from a definition for livestock. It is not clear that a definition is needed.             | disallow |
| Empson, Alan Jephson Howard<br>Submitter ID: 74152       | New definition - Forest                                | PC1-9095  | oppose | The amendment sought is uncertain.                                                                                                                  | disallow |
| South Waikato District Council<br>Submitter ID: 72892    | New definition – Regionally significant infrastructure | PC1-9724  | oppose | The new definition is uncertain as “ancillary infrastructure” and to how it applies to the plan provisions                                          | disallow |
| Taupo District Council<br>Submitter ID: 74207            | New definition – Regionally significant infrastructure | PC1-8172  | oppose | The inclusion sought is uncertain as it may apply as site specific rather than for a regional significance                                          | disallow |
| Hamilton City Council<br>Submitter ID: 74051             | New definition – regionally significant infrastructure | PC1-10208 | oppose | The amendment is uncertain in terms of providing a “similar” definition to the RPS. Nor is it clear how this definition would be appropriate to PC1 | disallow |
| Fonterra Co-operative Group Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74057   | New definition – effective                             | PC1-10616 | oppose | The amendment sought is uncertain as to how it will apply in the plan.                                                                              | disallow |

|                                                          |                                                       |           |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |          |
|----------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------|-----------|-----------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
|                                                          | hectares                                              |           |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |          |
| Fonterra Co-operative Group Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74057   | New definition – protected wetland                    | PC1-10616 | oppose          | The amendment sought is uncertain as to how it will apply in the plan.                                                                                                                                                                                                   | disallow |
| Hamilton City Council<br>Submitter ID: 74051             | New definition – ecosystem services                   | PC1-10208 | Support in part | Such a definition may be helpful in the context of the resource use however it also needs to be considered in the context of natural values. This should include the including consideration of direct and indirect benefits to economic, social and cultural wellbeing. | allow    |
| Horticulture New Zealand (HortNZ)<br>Submitter ID: 73801 | New definition – Catchment Collective                 | PC1-10227 | oppose          | The definition is uncertain as it applies to the provisions in the plan                                                                                                                                                                                                  | disallow |
| Horticulture New Zealand (HortNZ)<br>Submitter ID: 73801 | New definition - Certified Farm Environment Planner   | PC1-10227 | oppose          | The definition is inappropriate in relation to the provisions of a plan, however guidance could be included to ensure appropriate conditions are set on resource consents.                                                                                               | disallow |
| Horticulture New Zealand (HortNZ)<br>Submitter ID: 73801 | New definition - Sub-catchment Scale Management Plans | PC1-10227 | oppose          | The definition is uncertain as it applies to the provisions in the plan                                                                                                                                                                                                  | disallow |
| Maniapoto Maori                                          | New                                                   | PC1-9369  | oppose          | The definition proposed is uncertain as worded. If a                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | disallow |

|                                                                           |                                                             |          |         |                                                                                                                                                                                 |          |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------|----------|---------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| Trust Board<br>Submitter ID: 73730                                        | definition –<br>intermittently<br>flowing<br>river          |          |         | definition is needed to clarify terms in the plan it will<br>need to be clearly worded.                                                                                         |          |
| New Zealand Grain<br>and Seed Trade<br>Association<br>Submitter ID: 71229 | New<br>definition –<br>winter                               | PC1-1688 | oppose  | The amendment sought is uncertain                                                                                                                                               | disallow |
| Waikato Regional<br>Council<br>Submitter ID: 72890                        | New<br>definition –<br>Current<br>version of<br>Overseer    | PC1-3666 | Support | Consistent with best use of Overseer                                                                                                                                            | allow    |
| Waikato Regional<br>Council<br>Submitter ID: 72890                        | New<br>definition –<br>Nitrogen<br>Reference<br>Period      | PC1-3666 | oppose  | It is uncertain whether this is a new definition or an<br>amendment. The amended wording does not resolve<br>the matters raised in Forest and Birds submission.                 | disallow |
| Waikato Regional<br>Council<br>Submitter ID: 72890                        | New<br>definition –<br>Nitrogen<br>reference<br>period data | PC1-3666 | oppose  | The definition is uncertain in how they apply to the<br>provisions of the plan and whether the best<br>environmental outcomes will be achieved to deliver on<br>the objectives. | disallow |
| Waikato Regional<br>Council<br>Submitter ID: 72890                        | New<br>definition –<br>Nitrogen<br>Reference<br>point data  | PC1-3666 | oppose  | The definition is uncertain in how they apply to the<br>provisions of the plan and whether the best<br>environmental outcomes will be achieved to deliver on<br>the objectives. | disallow |
| Waikato Regional<br>Council                                               | New<br>definition –                                         | PC1-3666 | oppose  | It is not appropriate to have different definitions for the<br>same term. If there is a need to address a specific                                                              | disallow |

|                                                      |                                                |           |        |                                                                                                                                                                                                    |          |
|------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|-----------|--------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| Submitter ID: 72890                                  | Wetland                                        |           |        | location of matter this should be set out within the relevant provision.                                                                                                                           |          |
| Wairakei Pastoral Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74095         | New definition – adaptive management           | PC1-11400 | oppose | The words proposed go beyond defining the term. A definition of adaptive management is not appropriate to manage effects. As worded it is uncertain whether the objectives of the plan can be met. | disallow |
| Wairakei Pastoral Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74095         | New definition – Decision Support Tool         | PC1-11400 | oppose | The definition sought is inappropriate in making decisions under the RMA and is uncertain in the context of the plan provisions to achieve the objectives.                                         | disallow |
| Wairakei Pastoral Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74095         | New definition – mitigation measures           | PC1-11400 | oppose | The definition is inappropriate                                                                                                                                                                    | disallow |
| Wairakei Pastoral Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74095         | New definition – sub-catchment management plan | PC1-11400 | oppose | The definition is inappropriate                                                                                                                                                                    | disallow |
| Wallace, Martin<br>Lindsay<br>Submitter ID: 72975    | New definition – Nitrogen discharge limit      | PC1-8403  | oppose | The amendment sought is inappropriate                                                                                                                                                              | disallow |
| Grainger, Chris and<br>Andrea<br>Submitter ID: 74153 | New definition – Water bodies                  | PC1-8187  | oppose | The amendment sought is inconsistent with the RMA which includes an intermittently flowing river as a water body                                                                                   | disallow |

|                                                                       |                                             |           |         |                                                                                                                            |          |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|-----------|---------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| Mangakotukutuku Stream Care Group Incorporated<br>Submitter ID: 72412 | New definition – Wetland                    | PC1-4474  | oppose  | The definition amendment proposed is inconsistent with the RPS                                                             | disallow |
| Wairakei Pastoral Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74095                          | New definition – Point source discharges    | PC1-11400 | oppose  | The amendment sought is inappropriate                                                                                      | disallow |
| FarmRight<br>Submitter ID: 73720                                      | New definition - Freshwater Management Unit | PC1-5415  | oppose  | The definition sought is uncertain                                                                                         | disallow |
| <b>Amendments to definitions</b>                                      |                                             |           |         |                                                                                                                            |          |
| Waikato Regional Council<br>Submitter ID: 72890                       | 75 <sup>th</sup> percentile                 | PC1-3664  | oppose  | The amendments sought do not clarify the definition.                                                                       | disallow |
| Wairarapa Moana Incorporation<br>Submitter ID: 72480                  | 75 <sup>th</sup> percentile                 | PC1-2158  | support | As written the 7 <sup>th</sup> percentile is uncertain and inappropriately applied in the plan.                            | allow    |
| AFFCO New Zealand Limited<br>Submitter ID: 74140                      | Best management practice                    | PC1-7675  | oppose  | The amendment sought is not appropriate as best practicable option is different concept and approach.                      | disallow |
| Fertiliser Association of New Zealand<br>Submitter ID: 73305          | Best management practice                    | PC1-10659 | oppose  | The amendment sought is uncertain as to what is “good management practice” and how this would be applied in the provisions | disallow |
| Horticulture New Zealand (HortNZ)<br>Submitter ID: 73801              | Enterprises                                 | PC1-10232 | oppose  | The specification of primary industries is not appropriate                                                                 | disallow |
| Fonterra Co-operative                                                 | Five-year                                   | PC1-10576 | oppose  | the amendment sought is uncertain and may result in                                                                        | disallow |

|                                                                                        |                              |           |        |                                                                                                                                                               |          |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------|--------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| Group Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 74057                                                       | rolling average              |           |        | slower decreases of nitrogen loss requirements                                                                                                                |          |
| Genetic Technologies Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 73953                                        | Forage crop                  | PC1-3341  | oppose | The exclusions sought are inappropriate                                                                                                                       | disallow |
| Kilgour, Gareth<br>Submitter ID: 72950                                                 | Forage crop                  | PC1-1953  | oppose | The exclusions sought are inappropriate                                                                                                                       | disallow |
| McGovern, Annette<br>Submitter ID: 72969                                               | Forage crop                  | PC1-8295  | oppose | The exclusions sought are inappropriate                                                                                                                       | disallow |
| New Zealand Grain and Seed Trade Association<br>Submitter ID: 71229                    | Forage crop                  | PC1-1680  | oppose | The exclusions sought are inappropriate                                                                                                                       | disallow |
| AFFCO New Zealand Limited<br>Submitter ID: 74140                                       | Good management practice     | PC1-7678  | oppose | The amendment sought is not appropriate as best practicable option is different concept and approach.                                                         | disallow |
| Auckland/Waikato Fish and Game and Eastern Region Fish and Game<br>Submitter ID: 74085 | Livestock crossing structure | PC1-11017 | oppose | The amendments sought are not appropriate in the definition. These matters would be better addressed as conditions and standards for new structures.          | disallow |
| Waipapa Farms Ltd and Carlyle Holdings Ltd<br>Submitter ID: 73863                      | Offsets                      | PC1-4640  | Oppose | The amendment sought confuses the concepts offset and compensation. It is not clear how either could effectively be applied to achieve water quality targets. | disallow |
|                                                                                        |                              |           |        |                                                                                                                                                               |          |

**Table 3:** Forest & Bird further submits on the following specific decisions requested on V1:

| Submitter Name/Submitter ID                                                         | provision | Submission Point ID       | Support or Oppose | Reason for Support/Opposition                                                                                                                                                                                    | Decision sought |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|---------------------------|-------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| Variation 1- general                                                                |           |                           |                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                 |
| Auckland/Waikato Fish and Game and Eastern Region Fish and Game Submitter ID: 74085 | General   | V1PC1-1548                | Support           | The councils reliance on a flawed s32 report to inform plan development has resulted in an ineffective approach and timeframes to nutrient and thus water quality management.                                    | allow           |
| Auckland/Waikato Fish and Game and Eastern Region Fish General and Game             | General   | V1PC1-336                 | Support           | Support RETAINING the notification date of 22 October 2016 within the Explanatory Statement. (V1)                                                                                                                | disallow        |
| Beef + Lamb New Zealand Limited Submitter ID: 73369                                 | General   | V1PC1-1703                | Oppose            | The exceptions to stock exclusion are not appropriate.                                                                                                                                                           | disallow        |
| Beef + Lamb New Zealand Limited Submitter ID: 73369                                 | General   | V1PC1-1703                | Oppose            | The monitoring and management of nitrogen discharge is necessary to achieve water quality objectives. The removal of provisions with manage nitrogen discharges will not give effect to the NPS FM.              | disallow        |
| Beef + Lamb New Zealand Limited Submitter ID: 73369                                 | General   | V1PC1-1705 and V1PC1-1729 | Support in part   | Forest and bird agree with beef and Lamb that the section 32 analyses are inadequate. However the alternative provisions sought in the submission are generally not appropriate.                                 | allow           |
| Department of Conservation Submitter ID: 71759                                      | General   | V1PC1-1269, V1PC1-1698    | Support           | Forest and bird agree with DOC that the section 32 analyses are inadequate. For instance it does not include the benefits of water quality maintenance and improvements in the model. This has resulted in costs | allow           |

|                                                       |                                                                       |            |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |               |
|-------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|-----------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------|
|                                                       |                                                                       |            |                 | being determined to be higher and the timeframes to achieve targets being determined to require longer.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |               |
| Waikato River Authority Submitter ID: 74033 Support   | General                                                               | V1PC1-375  | Support         | The plan wording which includes 'wetland and springs' alongside the term 'river' and the amendment sought to include 'lakes' is appropriate                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | allow         |
| Waikato River Authority Submitter ID: 74033 Support   | General                                                               | V1PC1-1017 | Support         | The amendments sought are appropriate.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |               |
| Beef + Lamb New Zealand Limited Submitter ID: 73369   | General                                                               | V1PC1-1656 | Support in part | While efficient resource use is a relevant consideration the amendment sought is not clear on how this is relevant in an objective for water quality outcomes. A nitrogen allocation framework is necessary to give effect to the NPS FM.                                                                                                                         | Allow in part |
| <b>Background and explanation</b>                     |                                                                       |            |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |               |
| Horticulture New Zealand (HortNZ) Submitter ID: 73801 | Collaborative approach                                                | V1PC1-1618 | Support in part | Amendments to acknowledge that the plan does not adequately address all sources of contaminants that impact on values identified in the Vision and Strategy are appropriate.                                                                                                                                                                                      | Allow         |
| Balle Bros Group Submitter ID: 67834                  | Full achievement of the Vision and Strategy will be intergenerational | V1PC1-1045 | oppose          | The amendments sought are inappropriate. Changing the words "Full achievement of the Vision and Strategy" to "The 80-year timeframe recognizes the 'innovation gap' that means full achievement of water quality requires technologies or practices that are not yet available or economically feasible." This undermines the objectives and purpose of the plan. | disallow      |
| <b>3.11.2 Objectives</b>                              |                                                                       |            |                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |               |
| Tuwharetoa Maori Trust Board Submitter ID: 73356      | 3.11.2                                                                | V1PC1-1381 | Support in part | This is appropriate to capture all freshwater ecosystems types.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | allow         |

| Objective 1                                          |                                                                                                                          |            |         |                                                           |          |
|------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|---------|-----------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| Maniapoto Maori Trust Board Submitter ID: 73730      | Objective 1: Long-term restoration and protection of water quality for each sub-catchment and Freshwater Management Unit | V1PC1-1291 | support | We support the statement of the Trust.                    | allow    |
| Policy 3                                             |                                                                                                                          |            |         |                                                           |          |
| Federated Farmers of New Zealand Submitter ID: 74191 | Use values - Human health for recreation                                                                                 | V1PC1-108  | Oppose  | Amendments sought are not appropriate                     | disallow |
| 3.11.4.4 Lakes and Whangamarino Wetland              |                                                                                                                          |            |         |                                                           |          |
| Primary Land Users Group Submitter ID: 71427         | 3.11.4.4 Lakes and Whangamarino Wetland                                                                                  | V1PC1-495  | support | Support to achieve improvements to ecosystem health       | allow    |
|                                                      |                                                                                                                          |            |         |                                                           |          |
| Glossary of terms                                    |                                                                                                                          |            |         |                                                           |          |
| Coles, Donald Percy Submitter ID: 71337              | New definition "suitable mitigation"                                                                                     | V1PC1-699  | oppose  | The definition and process referred to are inappropriate. | disallow |

Thank you for your consideration.

Yours faithfully

Rebecca Stirnemann

Regional Manager, Central Northland  
Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Inc